

- My name is Aaron Leung. I'm the Past Chair of the City of Vancouver Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee
- 21 person advisory committee with a mandate to advise City Council, School Board and Park Board on matters related to children, youth and families
- Members as young as 7. 2/3rds of the Advisory Committee is under the age of 22.
- Currently stands discharged since November 2018. Council is voting on re-establishing Advisory Committees this week
- In 2016, the Committee took a position on the previous Long Range Facilities Plan and met with multiple Vancouver MLAs to discuss our concerns with the Ministry imposed 95% utilization ratio and budget cuts
 - A copy of the letter and motion are attached to this document
- In addition, the Committee took a position on school closures and the sale of school board land
 - A copy of the motion is attached to this document
- The Committee also took a position on the 2016 Milburn Forensic Audit. Specifically, I want to highlight our concerns with the recommendations regarding the sale of public assets
 - A copy of the motion is attached to this document.
- All motions received unanimous committee support
- At the time, the Committee was concerned with the potential sale of Kingsgate Mall to fund the Operating Budget and the impact of the sale of public assets on future generations
- The Committee motion related to the sale of public land states that " The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee strongly supports preserving public lands owned by the Vancouver School Board for future generations to fulfill its educational mandate for all present and future children"

- Today, I'm here as an individual to express my concerns regarding the updated Long Range Facilities Plan
- Specifically, I'd like to speak to the following:
 - The Lack of Public Consultation
 - Concerns regarding capacity utilization projections and data quality
 - Concerns regarding equity and community impacts
 - Addressing how the LRFP impacts and potentially conflicts with the Environmental Sustainability Plan

- I've participated in dozens of public consultations, facilitated some, and worked with multiple staff departments at the City of Vancouver to provide input on city projects and plans which totals 100+ hours
- Never. And I mean never have I been told that there is no plan or need for public consultation on a major plan
- As staff and Board Members can see tonight, the public is heavily investing in our neighbourhood schools
- Two Committee Meetings and an email account is not enough for an average plan and is certainly not enough for a wide-reaching plan that will impact the lives of hundreds of students if consolidation plans move forward.
- In 2018, I sat in this very seat and gave a presentation as an individual on the 2018/19 Operating Budget
- There were concerns at the time from members of the public that there was a lack of public consultation.
- I suggested that the Board adopt a Public Engagement framework based on International Association of Public Participation standards that allows for multiple opportunities of public comment, and breaks down the barriers to public participation.
- **Once again, I'm reiterating my call to elected officials at this table to get a framework in place and also to slow down the LRFP update process to allow for public consultations in the communities who may be impacted by this plan, collect feedback, and adapt the plan as necessary to address community concerns**
- No consultation plan is perfect. People will complain that there hasn't been enough public consultation. But having no consultation plan is unacceptable.
- Bluntly, if the Board plans to adopt this plan in April without doing so and informing school communities after the fact is unacceptable outcome.
- The public deserves broad consultation on the future of our public schools and public assets.
- In 2016, during the initial LRFP formulation, I had concerns about the utilization projection numbers contained in the report because they excluded non-enrolling space from the calculation. Effectively, I was told these spaces were marked as "empty" space
- In April 2016, the Manager of Facilities and a consultant came to my Committee at the time and I asked a question about getting a ball park on our current utilization excluding non-enrolling space
- I was told that because the LRFP was a Ministry commissioned report that staff did not have a number (or a ball park) and that staff were counting spaces as outlined by the Ministry
- Today, I and others are once again concerned with the utilization projects
- **I'm calling on VSB elected officials to direct staff to include a utilization projection that excludes non-enrolling space as an appendix to this report so that we can get a clear idea and have a discussion about the future of so called "empty" space**
- We know that non-enrolling spaces, like music rooms, libraries, and resource rooms provide a crucial support for our students. I and many others think that these spaces are well used and including them as "empty space" in the enrolment projections inaccurately depicts our schools

- Other members of the public have also noticed discrepancies in the FCI values and the operating capacity for certain schools listed in the LRFP appendices
 - o Specifically, one parent noted that in the Cavell PDR, the FCI was listed as 0.60. In the LRFP it's now listed at 0.53
 - o Some others have also listed concerns with current school population numbers.
 - o For example, some have noted that for AR Lord, that there are currently 184 students (also confirmed by Ministry of Education data) at the school while the LRFP lists their population at 159
- In order to have a fair conversation, the public needs to have faith in the numbers that justify school consolidations, and I don't believe that the public has faith in the LRFP data due to how non-enrolling spaces are counted and the discrepancies found in the appendices
- The public has a right to open, and transparent access to data used in this plan.
- **Tonight, I'm calling on VSB elected officials to direct staff to make all of the data from Baragar used to make projections and justify consolidation in the LRFP open access for public researchers through an open data database or as an appendix to the LRFP**
- As an academic studying geography and spatial data at SFU, who first developed a passion for Geography in Geography 12 at Killarney, I've learned that methods in academic reports need to be reproduceable by researchers and open to scrutiny
- As the VSB is a public, academic institution, the public should be able to get transparent access to data (keeping in mind privacy concerns). As the VSB is a public, academic institution and if you are willing to stand by your projections, you should be open to scrutiny by academics and members of the public
- I also have concerns with the potential impacts to the Environmental Sustainability Plan
- The ESP states that the VSB wants to support active transportation to and from schools including walking and biking
- Consolidating neighbourhood schools will impact walkability and the VSB's active transportation goals if schools are farther away for students and parents
- In conclusion, staff and Board Members need to consider these tradeoffs when considering consolidation (equity, active transportation, socio-economic factors) not just capacity numbers



CHILDREN, YOUTH AND FAMILIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MINUTES

Thursday, April 14, 2016

A meeting of the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee (CYFAC) was held on Thursday, April 14, 2016, at 5:35 pm, in the Town Hall Meeting Room, Main Floor, City Hall.

PRESENT: Yasmin Ali, Chair
Nico Cullen-McKnight
Janice Douglas
Joy Fan
Lena Hozaima*
Aaron Leung, Vice-Chair
Iris Liu
Christy Lo*
Tasha Nijjar*
Mab Oloman
Samantha Truong*
Wenyng Wu
Frank Yan
Anna Zhang*
Joy Zhou

ABSENT: Eric Wong (Leave of Absence)

ALSO PRESENT: Commissioner Catherine Evans, Vancouver Park Board
Julie Iannacone, Staff Liaison, Vancouver Public Library

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Leslie Tuerlings, Meeting Coordinator

* Denotes absence for a portion of the meeting.

Leave of Absence Requests

MOVED by Janice Douglas
SECONDED by Frank Yan

THAT Eric Wong be granted a Leave of Absence for the meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Lena Hozaima and Tasha Nijjar absent for the vote)

Approval of Minutes

MOVED by Frank Yan
SECONDED by Joy Zhou

THAT the minutes of the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee meeting held on February 18, 2015, be approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Lena Hozaima and Tasha Nijjar absent for the vote)

VARY AGENDA

MOVED by Aaron Leung

THAT Item 6 be dealt with following the completion of Item 2.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

Note: For clarity, the minutes are recorded in chronological order.

1. Long Range Facilities Plan

Amanda Gibbs, Principal, Public Assembly and Kelly Isford-Saxon, Manager of Planning, Vancouver School Board, provided a presentation on this matter and responded to questions.

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Joy Fan

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee form an Education Subcommittee.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Mab Oloman

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee send a letter to the Minister of Education, Vancouver MLAs, and Board Trustees, regarding the budget deficit and Long Range Facilities Plan no later than April 28, 2016.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

2. Future City and Committee Projects

Robyn Newton, Social Planner, Social Policy and Projects, provided an overview of the City's Healthy City Strategy and noted current and upcoming projects associated with the initiative.

6. Election of Chairs

The Meeting Coordinator called for nominations for the positions of Chair and Vice-Chair of the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee, terms to end February 28, 2017.

Subsequently, the following members were elected by acclamation:

- Yasmin Ali, Chair
- Aaron Leung, Vice-Chair

The following members expressed interest in learning more about the role of Chair, and were designated as Junior Chairs:

- Joy Fan
- Christy Lo
- Wenying Wu

3. Working Session Feedback / Subcommittee Updates

Janice Douglas reviewed a list provided by City staff of possible topics a Housing Subcommittee could explore.

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Wenying Wu

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee form a Housing Subcommittee with Janice Douglas as the Chair.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Christy Lo, Samantha Truong and Anna Zhang absent for the vote)

4. Access Without Fear

Mab Oloman reviewed a letter sent by the Committee to Mayor and Council in December 2014 in support of designating Vancouver as a Sanctuary City. She also noted that at the April 6, 2016, Council meeting, Council unanimously adopted an "Access to City Services Without Fear" policy and encouraged the boards of Parks and Recreation, the Vancouver Police, and the Vancouver Public Library, to do the same.

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Mab Oloman

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee send a letter to the boards of Parks and Recreation, the Vancouver Police, and the Vancouver Public Library, encouraging them to adopt policies which support the spirit and objectives of the "Access to City Services Without Fear for Residents With Uncertain or No Immigration Status" policy.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Christy Lo, Samantha Truong and Anna Zhang absent for the vote)

5. Working Plan Feedback and Discussion

The Chair and Vice-Chair reviewed documents related to the Work Plan and advised that they will be discussed in more detail at the upcoming Working Session.

7. New Business

a) Announcements and Reminders

The Chair and Vice-Chair announced that they will be holding informal meetings on a drop-in basis that will be open to both committee and non-committee members. A calendar of these dates will be circulated shortly.

The Chair also reminded members to follow the email guidelines that were previously created by the Committee and to attend Working Sessions.

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Joy Fan
SECONDED by Aaron Leung

THAT the meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Christy Lo, Samantha Truong and Anna Zhang absent for the vote)

Next Regular Meeting:

DATE: Thursday, June 2, 2016
TIME: 5:30 pm
PLACE: Committee Room 1, Third Floor, City Hall

The Committee adjourned at 7:56 pm.

* * * * *

April 28, 2016

Hon. Mike Bernier
Minister of Education, MLA Peace River South

Dear Minister Bernier:

RE: Vancouver School Board 2016 Budget Deficit

We are writing to you today regarding the 2016 Vancouver School Board budget deficit of \$24 million. At our meeting on April 14th, the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee unanimously passed a motion to write to our local representatives and share our concerns about the state of public education in Vancouver. The Committee believes that every child must have access to a well-funded education system that supports their needs. Committee Members have noticed that over the past decade, education in B.C has been subject to continuous cuts to services that support students in their success. This year's budget deficit in Vancouver exemplifies the difficulties this district faces in delivering quality education to students.

Particularly, the Committee is concerned about the well-being of students attending public schools in Vancouver. Compared with the rest of the country, B.C has the second lowest funding per student and teachers are among the lowest paid in Canada. The process of seismically upgrading schools has already been pushed back from 2020 to 2030 in turn endangering the lives of students in at risk schools in the event of an earthquake. In 2015, the Committee wrote to the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services about public education. The recommendations of the Standing Committee included "sustainable and adequate funding" for school districts (see attachments). Currently, the Committee sees the current service level and budget deficit as a failure of the Government to follow through on its own recommendations from a bipartisan committee.

With respect to the new government requirement of achieving a 95% utilization ratio in order to receive further funding for projects, the Committee does not agree that this is the best path for the support of a community learning environment. The Committee stands firm on its belief that critical childcare space and resource rooms should not be counted as empty space as they serve students in support of their educational goals. As the Vancouver school district looks at closing schools to meet this requirement, we see this both as a loss of vital community spaces and service accessibility for disabled and special needs children. Students deserve to stay in the schools that they call home and work in a space that is safe and seismically sound.

The lack of funding over the past decade is continuously putting British Columbia's strong education system at risk with many valued programs on the list of budget cuts. Once again, the Committee reaffirms its support for the arts and specialty education programs. We believe that every child in public schools should have access to programs that allows them to foster their potential and empower students to pursue their interests. Committee Members attended one of the budget consultations, and heard from citizens in the LGBTQ community that the Anti-Racism and Anti-Homophobia Teacher Mentor position, which is eliminated from this year's budget, saves lives. This is just one example of the real-world impacts to the well-being of students. Every year this district attempts to save programs for the benefit of students. But this year's deficit of \$24 million will most likely require cuts to cherished programs such as mini school and elementary school music programs. We ask that the B.C Government properly fund the education system, not only in Vancouver, but also throughout British Columbia so that students can continue to access imperative programs that meet their educational needs and ensures their safety.

If you are in Vancouver, Committee Members would appreciate a meeting with you in the coming weeks to discuss our concerns. We look forward to your reply and will be following up on our request.

Best regards,



Yasmin Ali
Committee Chairperson
(604) 319-9334
yasmin.aliya03@gmail.com



Aaron Leung
Committee Vice-Chair
(604) 970-7818
aaronchrisleung@gmail.com

Copies to: All Vancouver Board of Education Trustees and Student Trustee
Hon. Suzanne Anton, Minister of Justice, MLA for Vancouver-Fraserview
Hon. Stephanie Cadieux, Minister of Children and Family Development
Spencer Chandra Herbert, MLA for Vancouver-West End
Hon. Michael de Jong, Minister of Finance
Adrian Dix, MLA Vancouver-Kingsway
Doug Donaldson, Children and Family Development Critic
David Eby, MLA Vancouver-Point Grey
Mable Elmore, MLA Vancouver-Kensington
Rob Fleming, Education Critic, MLA Victoria-Swan Lake
George Heyman, MLA Vancouver-Fairview
Carole James, Finance Critic, MLA Victoria-Beacon Hill
Melanie Mark, MLA Vancouver-Mount Pleasant
Shane Simpson, MLA Vancouver-Hastings
Moirra Stilwell, MLA Vancouver-Langara
Sam Sullivan, MLA Vancouver-False Creek
Hon. Andrew Wilkinson, Minister of Advanced Education, MLA Vancouver-Quilchena

Approval of Minutes

MOVED by Frank Yan
SECONDED by Joy Zhou

THAT the minutes of the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee meeting held on February 18, 2015, be approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Lena Hozaima and Tasha Nijjar absent for the vote)

VARY AGENDA

MOVED by Aaron Leung

THAT Item 6 be dealt with following the completion of Item 2.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

Note: For clarity, the minutes are recorded in chronological order.

1. Long Range Facilities Plan

Amanda Gibbs, Principal, Public Assembly and Kelly Isford-Saxon, Manager of Planning, Vancouver School Board, provided a presentation on this matter and responded to questions.

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Joy Fan

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee form an Education Subcommittee.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Mab Oloman

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee send a letter to the Minister of Education, Vancouver MLAs, and Board Trustees, regarding the budget deficit and Long Range Facilities Plan no later than April 28, 2016.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

2. Future City and Committee Projects

Robyn Newton, Social Planner, Social Policy and Projects, provided an overview of the City's Healthy City Strategy and noted current and upcoming projects associated with the initiative.

h) Response to Peter Milburn's Forensic Audit of the Vancouver School Board

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Fiona Fan

WHEREAS

1. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee has reviewed Peter Milburn's Forensic Audit of the Vancouver School Board;
2. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee is concerned about multiple recommendations included in the Audit Report.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee reject the following recommendations from the Auditor's Report and include these points in letters to Vancouver City Council, the Board of Education, Vancouver MLAs, the Minister of Education, and the Premier of BC:

R2: "The VSB update and clarify its policies relating to governance to ensure that Trustees are bound to conduct themselves in accordance with their role as stewards rather than advocates."

R9: "Consistent with best practices at other School Districts, the VSB designate committee meetings as in camera in an effort to depoliticize discussions and allow Trustees to focus on providing effective oversight."

R10: "The VSB delegate stakeholder consultation to VSB management with the results presented to Trustees at relevant Committee meetings."

R19: "The VSB immediately update the Long Range Facilities Plan (LRFP) to reduce facility costs and align the space requirements per pupil with other comparable school districts."

R25 "The VSB conduct a strategic review of the real estate assets by a qualified professional regarding (i) the existing market value of the surplus lands (by way of sale or lease); and (ii) the closed and pending closed school annexes, proposed school closure associated with the LRFP, and non-school assets. This is consistent with EY recommendation BR15."

R26: "The VSB retain real estate professionals to assess the market rental potential and highest and best use of each of the school facilities proposed for closure in the LRFP, and adopt those recommendations that result in the best financial outcome. This is consistent with EY recommendation BR16."

R27: "The VSB work with the Province to develop viable options for achieving early value (revenue) from the transfer of a partial interest in the Kingsgate Mall to the Province."

AND FURTHER THAT without additional information, the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee take a neutral position on the remaining recommendations in the Auditor's Report.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4. VPD Access without Fear

Tasha Nijjar provided an update on the consultation process and status of the Vancouver Police Department's draft Access without Fear policy.

5. Impact of City Policies on Race and Ethnic Relations

Eric Wong noted the importance of being aware of the unintentional impacts that City policy may have on specific ethnic groups. This will be discussed further at the Committee's Working Session.

6. 2016 City Budget Discussion

Janet Douglas noted that she attended the 2016 City Budget Discussion and expressed the importance of invitations being sent with advance notice so that the Committee is able to discuss the topic prior to sending a representative.

7. New Business

a) Fresh Voices Awards

Tasha Nijjar reminded the Committee about the Fresh Voices Awards. The link to the nomination form will be circulated.

b) Education Subcommittee Town Hall Meeting

Aaron Leung noted that the Education Subcommittee will hold a town hall meeting in January. Committee members interested in helping with this event should let Aaron know.

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Lena Hozaima
SECONDED by Wenying Wu

THAT the meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

d) Requesting a Liaison from the Vancouver Board of Education

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Tasha Nijjar

WHEREAS

1. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee recognizes that the Vancouver Board of Education has been dismissed by the Minister of Education;
2. Due to the actions taken by the Minister of Education, the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee has been informed by the City Clerk's Office that it no longer has a liaison from the Vancouver Board of Education;
3. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee recognizes its role in advising Council, Park Board and School Board, and to receive adequate and timely information, requires a Liaison from the Vancouver Board of Education in order to provide sound advice;
4. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee recognizes that all other Civic Agencies no longer have a liaison appointed due to the dismissal.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee send a letter to Dianne Turner, Appointed Trustee for the Vancouver Board of Education, to discuss options regarding the appointment of a staff liaison from the Vancouver School Board to attend the Committee's Regular meetings.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

e) Opposing the Disposal of Public Lands by the Vancouver School Board

MOVED by Aaron Leung
SECONDED by Anna Zhang

WHEREAS

1. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee recognizes the continued budget shortfalls at the Vancouver School Board over the past decade due to government underfunding;
2. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee strongly supports preserving public lands owned by the Vancouver School Board for future generations to fulfill its educational mandate for all present and future children;
3. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee acknowledges that in June, the Minister of Education allowed the Vancouver School Board to use a

portion of the money received from the sale of Kingsgate Mall to fund the Operating Budget if the Vancouver School Board were to sell the land;

4. The Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee recognizes the Supreme Court of Canada's decision in favour of the British Columbia Teachers' Federation that recognizes the ability of the union to negotiate class size and composition as a part of their Collective Bargaining Agreement.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee oppose the disposal of any School Board owned property to balance the Operating Budget including, but not limited to school property and Kingsgate Mall;

FURTHER THAT the funds from the disposal of public property should not be used to fund the Operating Budget of the Vancouver School Board for it is the Province's duty to adequately fund public education and is not permitted through the *School Act*;

AND FURTHER THAT any consideration of the sale of public land be done by a Board of Education elected by Vancouver citizens and not by an appointed trustee from the Provincial Government.

- B. THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee recommend that Vancouver City Council support this position to preserve public lands for the residents of Vancouver and future neighbourhoods, including the planned growth along the Cambie Corridor.
- C. THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee acknowledge that the ruling from the Supreme Court of Canada may result in the need for more classroom space, therefore the process of property disposal should not be considered until the impact of this ruling is assessed and the completion of the negotiation process between the Province and the British Columbia Teachers' Federation on class size and composition is complete.
- D. THAT the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee send a letter to Dianne Turner, Official Trustee of the Vancouver School Board, the Minister of Education and the Premier of BC, copied to Vancouver City Council, and all Vancouver MLAs, outlining our concerns;

AND FURTHER THAT the above-noted letter be posted to the Children, Youth and Families Advisory Committee's Facebook page.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY